

## PERSPECTIVES ON PRESERVATION

Tuesday, 7:00 to 10:00 pm  
Prof. Jeffrey Chusid  
TA: Stephanie Smith.

211 W. Sibley Hall  
Office: 210 W. Sibley. Email: [jmc286@cornell.edu](mailto:jmc286@cornell.edu)  
Email: [sas478@cornell.edu](mailto:sas478@cornell.edu)



This class introduces the history, theory and practice of historic preservation: the conservation and management of cultural and natural resources. We will examine the nexus of social, political, economic, aesthetic and scientific issues encountered in the multi-disciplinary effort to save buildings, landscapes and rural and urban communities, and to bring them into a productive future life. The class does so through a focus on three concepts: 1) preservation is a form of design, and design is a political act; 2) preservation practice requires successfully articulating and communicating principles, rationales and ideologies associated with preservation debates within communities; and 3) preservation offers important strategies and tools for sustainable urban and regional planning. The various topics covered each week will address these strategies and tools, and are aimed not only at providing a comprehensive look at the field of preservation, but also allowing students to prepare a substantive final paper that places two preservation case studies within a well-developed context of urban planning, economic development, and community governance.

Readings will be available on Blackboard, or in the library. Readings are listed under the date they are due.

Grading will be based on attendance and lively participation, the two short exercises, and the term paper.

Current Event:	10%
Midterm:	25%
Final presentation:	10%
Paper (30-40 pp.):	45%
Participation:	10%

Three unexcused absences will result in a failing grade.

## REQUIRED TEXTS:

- Robert E. Stipe, ed, *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*. (University of North Carolina)
- Max Page and Randall Mason, eds, *Giving Preservation a History: Histories of Historic Preservation in the United States* (Routledge, 2004)
- James Marston Fitch, *Historic Preservation: Curatorial Management of the Built World* (University of Virginia).

## SUGGESTED TEXTS:

- Anthony M. Tung, *Preserving the World's Great Cities: The Destruction and Renewal of the Historic Metropolis* (Three Rivers Press 2002).
- Michael A. Tomlan, ed. *Preservation of What, For Whom?: A Critical Look at Historical Significance* (National Council for Preservation Education, 1998).

## ASSIGNMENTS

### Current Event: A Preservation Controversy

Find a newspaper article about a preservation controversy from the past year. Prepare a brief (no more than 5 page) paper that does the following:

- Summarizes the debate, especially as regards significance, integrity, and alternative outcomes.
- Identifies the stakeholders and discusses their underlying assumptions and world views.
- Identifies missing facts or other information from the article.
- Gives your opinion about an optimal resolution.

You will be asked to present your controversy in class.

### Midterm: Tuesday, October 27th

A midterm examination will be administered based on readings and class lectures through October 22<sup>nd</sup> (Week 8). Test subject matter will include history and structure of preservation in the United States, preservation planning and regulation at the local, state, and national levels, and preservation economic techniques.

### Term Paper and Presentation

#### Paper Choice 1:

Each student will produce a 20-minute in-class presentation and a 30-40 page term paper describing two current or recent preservation projects in a major US metropolitan area (ideally, a city with which you are NOT already familiar). One project should be (principally) publicly funded and managed, while the other should be (principally) privately funded and managed. Research will include background on city history and development of the local preservation movement, how each project was conceived and funded, a profile of the organization undertaking each project, interview material from key actors and stakeholders, and an evaluation of each project's success and lessons to be learned. (See attached description for further information about the paper.)

#### Paper Choice 2:

Students also have the option of creating their own research project that is equally comprehensive in nature. Papers should encompass economic, social, political issues in preservation planning. Please make an appointment with me to formulate a sufficient research topic. After consultation, a written proposal will be due the same time as the abstract for Paper Choice 1.

## WEEKLY OUTLINE AND READINGS

### September 1: Introduction

- Course materials & requirements
- Fundamental Assumptions and Concepts
  - Why We Preserve
  - The Nature and Scale of Cultural Resources
  - Significance --- Interpretation
  - Integrity --- Authenticity
  - The Political Nature of Design

\* *Current Event assigned*

Stipe, Prologue, "Why Preserve?" and "Abbreviations," in Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century* (University of North Carolina Press 2003).

**Tung**, “The Century of Destruction,” in Anthony M. Tung, *Preserving the World’s Great Cities: The Destruction and Renewal of the Historic Metropolis* (Three Rivers Press 2002).

**Fitch**, Chapter 4, “Conceptual Parameters of Historic Preservation,” in James Marston Fitch, *Historic Preservation: Curatorial Management of the Built World* (University of Virginia Press 1990).

**Page and Mason**, “Introduction,” in Max Page and Randall Mason, eds. *Giving Preservation a History: Histories of Historic Preservation in the United States* (Routledge, 2004).

#### September 8: Contemporary Issues in Preservation I – Stakeholders and Political Debates

- Narratives of Power
- Roles and Players
- Conflict and Political Process
- The Nature of Wicked Problems
- Discussion of Articles

\* *Current Event Due*

**Rittel and Weber**, “Dilemmas in a General Theory of Planning,”

**Gail Lee Dubrow**, “Redefining the Place of Historic Preservation in Planning Education and Practice,” *Planning Theory* 13, 1995.

**Catesby Leigh**, “Preservation Goes Awry,” *The American Enterprise*, July/August 2001.

#### September 15: History/Structure of Preservation in the United States

- Private Efforts: Independence Hall, Mt. Vernon, APVA, ASHPS, the Colonial Revival Movement, SPNEA
- The Outdoor Museum Concept in the US: Greenfield Village, Williamsburg.
- Domestic Preservation Structure and Players at the Local, State, and Federal Levels
- Roles of Government, Private Consultants, and Non-Profits.

**Howard Green**, “The Social Construction of Historical Significance,” in Michael A. Tomlan, ed. *Preservation of What, For Whom?: A Critical Look at Historical Significance*.

**Diane Lea**, “America’s Preservation Ethos,” in Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*.

**Robert E. Stipe**, “Some Preservation Fundamentals,” in Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*.

**John M Fowler**, “The Federal Preservation Program,” Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*.

**Kathryn Welch Howe**, “Private Sector Involvement in Historic Preservation,” Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*.

**J. Myrick Howard**, “Nonprofits in the American Preservation Movement,” Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*.

**Michael Holleran**, “Roots in Boston, Branches in Planning and Parks.” Max Page and Randall Mason, eds. *Giving Preservation a History: Histories of Historic Preservation in the United States* (Routledge, 2004).

**James Lindgren**, “The Spirit that Fires the Imagination.” Max Page and Randall Mason, eds. *Giving Preservation a History: Histories of Historic Preservation in the United States* (Routledge, 2004).

**Ada Louise Huxtable**, “Inventing American Reality,” *New York Review of Books*, 3 December 1992.

#### September 22: Preservation Planning and Regulation

Guest Speaker: **Chris Capella-Peters**, NYSHPO

- The Treatments: Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, Reconstruction
- Intro to Preservation Law and Regulation
- 1966 Historic Preservation Act creates National Register, SHPO system, 106 review
- 1966 Transportation Act’s section 4(f); environmental movement and EPA 1970; Moss-Bennett Act 1974 proposed National Heritage legislation
- Pivotal role of State Historic Preservation Offices in the National Register and review of federal actions.

Fitch, Chapters 8, 9, 11, 12

Advisory Council: "A 5-Minute Look at Section 106 Review."

Secretary of the Interior Standards

National Preservation Act of 1966

National Register Bulletin

Section 106 Flowchart

Example of a Section 106 Report

Neil Smith, "Market, State and Ideology," in *New Urban Frontier, Gentrification and the Revanchist City* (Routledge 1996).

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, Reconstruction). Available on line.

## September 29: Tools and Challenges of Preservation Planning at the Local Level

Guest Speaker: Leslie Chatterton, City of Ithaca

- Efforts by state and local non-profits: easements, revolving funds, neighborhood revitalization
- Efforts by state and local government: statewide inventories, state and local tax exemptions, the local design review process, CDCs
- Certified Local Government (CLG)
- Gentrification

Lina Cofresi and Rosetta Radtke, "Local Government Programs: Preservation Where it Counts,"

in Robert E. Stipe, ed. *A Richer Heritage: Historic Preservation in the Twenty-First Century*.

Roberta Gratz and Normal Mintz, "Mansfield, Ohio: Getting Off the Big Project Merry-go-Round." Gratz, Mintz, *Cities Back from the Edge* (John Wiley, 2000)

Roberta Gratz and Normal Mintz, "Project Planning or Urban Husbandry, The Choice;" Gratz, Mintz, *Cities Back from the Edge* (John Wiley, 2000)

Richard Wagner, "Local Government and Historic Preservation," *Historic Preservation Forum*.

Brookings Institution, "Chapters 1 – 4," *Dealing with Neighborhood Change, A Primer on Gentrification and Policy Choices*.

Pratt Cassity, "Still Local After All These Years..." *CRM* No. 6, 1996.

Katherine Adams, "Organizing Local Preservation," *Preservation Yellow Pages*.

Elizabeth Merritt, "Legal Advocacy," *Preservation Yellow Pages*.

Rebecca L. Flora, "South Side Local Redevelopment Company," *Historic Preservation Forum*, Spring 1995.

Grady Gammage, Jr., "The Property Right's Debate: A Preservationist's Guide." *Forum News*, May/June 1995.

## October 6: Zoning and Preservation

- East State Street Demolition and New Construction Project Case Study
- Building Codes, FARs, Preservation within Land Use Planning

East State Street Construction Site Plan

City Master Plan with Historic Preservation Element

Mel Green, "Building Codes and Historic Preservation: An Overview," *Forum Journal*, Spring 1988, Vol. 2, No. 1

Adrian Scott Fine and Jim Lindberg, "Taming the Teardown Trend," *Forum News*, July/August 2002.

*\*Term Paper Abstract/Proposal Due*

## October 13: FALL BREAK

## October 20: Preservation Economics

*\*Term Paper Parts 1, 2, 3 Due*

- Tax Credits and other Strategies
- Running a Simple Proforma
- Tax Reform Act of 1976, 1981 Economic Recovery Tax Act and the Tax Reform Act of 1986
- ISTEA. Affordable housing. National Historic Preservation Act Amendments of 1992

**Alexander J. Reichl**, "Historic Preservation and Progrowth Politics in US Cities," *Urban Affairs Review*, March 1997.  
 "Landmark Historic Preservation Executive Order Signed by the President," *Preservation Advocate News* Vol. 5, May 1996.

Center for Urban Policy Research, Rutgers, LBJ School for Public Policy, UT Austin, *Historic Preservation at Work for the Texas Economy*, 1999.

**David Listokin and Michael Lahr**, "Analyzing the Economic Impacts of Historic Preservation," *CRM* No. 6, 1997.

**Carolyn Douthat**, "Economic Incentives for Historic Preservation in Oakland, California," *Historic Preservation Forum*, Fall 1994.

**Matthew Bauer**, "Use It or Lose It," *Building Renovation*, Spring 1995.

National Main Street Center, "Getting Started in Main Street Revitalization," *Historic Preservation Magazine*.

**Kennedy Lawson Smith**, "Main Street at 15," *Historic Preservation Forum*, Spring 1995.

**Terry Lawhead**, "A Comprehensive Strategy for Rural Downtowns," *Economic Development Review*, Spring 1995.

US Dept of the Interior, *Preservation Tax Incentives for Historic Buildings*. 1996.

## October 27: Preservation in Context, Context is the Point

### \*Midterm Examination 1<sup>st</sup> hour

- The Commodification of Culture
- Specialties: Industrial archeology, vernacular architecture, garden and landscape preservation, etc.
- The rise of Heritage Area legislation, an alternative to 'parks;' the reaction in the National Park Service.

Garden State Parkway Effects Assessment

Steven Tiesdell, Taner Oc, Tim Heath, *Revitalizing Historic Urban Quarters* (Architectural Press, 2001): 68-165

Cheryl Hargrove, "Building Partnerships Through Heritage Tourism," *Historic Preservation Forum*, July/August 1991.

Enid Schildkrout, "Ghana Recycles Its Heritage," *Natural History* 2/96.

Ruth Knack, "Soul Cities," *Planning*, December 1997.

Fred P. Bossleman, Craig A. Peterson, Claire McCarthy, "Chapters 2, 4, 6," *Managing Tourism Growth: Issues and Applications*, Island Press, 1999.

Irene J. Winter, "Packaging the Past: The Benefits and Costs of Archaeological Tourism," *Partnership in Archaeology*, Fribourg University Press, 1997.

Gerald Takano, "Learning from Levuka, Fiji—Preservation in the First Colonial Capital," *CRM* No. 3, 1996.

ICOMOS, "International Tourism Charter," December 1998.

Venice City Council, "The Ventia Project," January 1996.

Anthony Tung, "Venice," in *Preserving the World's Great Cities: The Destruction and Renewal of the Historic Metropolis* (Three Rivers Press 2002).

## November 3: Sustainability

**Guest Speaker: Mina Amundsen, Cornell University Planner (tentative)**

- History of Sustainability
- LEED and Historic Preservation: Friend or Foe?

**Fitch**, Chapter 3, "The Economic Sense of Retrieval and Recycling," in James Marston Fitch, *Historic Preservation: Curatorial Management of the Built World*.

**Jeffrey Chusid**, "Natural Allies: Historic Preservation and Sustainable Design."

**Walter Sedovic**, "History's Green Genes."

**Robert A. Young**, "Historic Preservation and LEED."

**Carl Elefante**, AIA, LEED AP, "The Greenest Building is... One that is Already Built." *Forum Journal*, Summer 2007, Vol. 21, No. 4.

### November 10: Preservation and Design – Architecture Transformed

- Application of SOI Standards
- Compatibility of New Construction and Historic Resources

For this week's class, students will be asked to bring in three to five digital images of a recent project that involves new additions or changes to an existing, historic building or its site. For example, a significant transformation of an historic site is Norman Foster's addition to the Hearst Building in New York City. Examples of companion buildings to historic sites are the new visitor centers at Mount Vernon and the Darwin D. Martin House. Consult US and foreign architectural journals in the Fine Arts Library for ideas. Be prepared to discuss the project for five minutes. Information you provide should include project size and budget, the principal players, the significance of the original structure, the applicable historical codes or regulations, and your critical evaluation of the result. Finally, reference the theories of Ruskin, Morris et al in your critique.

**John Ruskin**, "The Lamp of Memory" from *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* (1849). New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1986.

**Nikolaus Pevsner**, "Scrape and anti-scrape," in Jane Fawcett, ed., *The Future of the Past: Attitudes to Conservation, 1174-1974*. London: Thames & Hudson, 1976.

**Sir John Summerson**, "Ruskin, Morris, and the Anti-scrape Philosophy," in Williams, Kellogg, and Gilbert, eds., *Readings in Historic Preservation*.

**William Morris**, "Restoration" (1877), in Stephan Tschudi Madsen, *Restoration and Anti-Restoration: A Study in English Restoration Philosophy*.

*\*Term Paper Parts 4, 5, 6 Due*

### November 17: Contemporary Issues in Preservation II

- Preservation of Modern Architecture
- Preservation and Housing and Community Development
- Realities of the National Register System
- Cultural Diversity and Politics

**Suzanna S. Pickens**, "The Silent Criteria: Misuse and Abuse of the National Register," in Michael A. Tomlan, ed. *Preservation of What, For Whom?: A Critical Look at Historical Significance*.

**Paul C. Brophy**, "New Roles for Preservation and Community Development," *Forum Journal*, Winter 2004.

### November 24: Student Presentations

*\*Term Paper Parts 7, 8 Due*

### December 1: Student Presentations

*\*Complete Term Paper Due December 10*

## PRESENTATION & TERM PAPER

Each student will produce a 20-minute in-class presentation and a 30-40 page term paper studying preservation activity in a major US metropolitan area, highlighting two current/recent preservation projects.

The city should be examined by learning about the current politics, economics, demographics, and recent major development activity, in order to provide your audience with a familiarity with the community. Current preservation activity in the private, private non-profit and public sectors should form the background for the two case studies. For example, did the business community, preservation organization or municipal officials support or oppose the projects under examination and, if so, how?

For each project you investigate, collect as much information as possible making use of books, magazines, newspapers, technical reports, and interviews. Web research (explore Nexis/Lexis) will also be useful. Document your sources carefully as you proceed, and include a full bibliography in the term paper.

The following topics are required elements of your case study. **Note the deadlines in the syllabus for submission of each section!**

1. Provide your audience with a quick historical overview of the community, focusing on the development of the immediate area in which your projects are located.
2. Give a thumbnail sketch of the "preservation climate" in the community, by examining efforts of the local government, non-profit advocacy groups, and notable private-sector projects.
3. Indicate the nature, intent or emphasis of each project you are examining; commemorative, commercial, educational, aesthetic, recreational? If the project has several emphases, indicate the original priorities.
4. Describe the a) physical and b) economic resources; that is, detail the context and site as well as opportunities: real estate holdings, the productive activities, the funding, and/or exploitable historical associations.
5. Describe the personnel and management operations; that is, indicate whether the project is governed by a board of directors, single owner or cooperative plan, and whether, after the scheme is complete, there is a property manager, executive director, etc., to conduct day-to-day affairs. Describe the people, especially if they have long-term involvement with the site or organization.
6. Explain the process by which preservation, restoration, adaptive re-use, reconstruction, rehabilitation, etc., took place. This is best done with comparison of 'before,' 'during,' and 'after' images. Were the Secretary of the Interior's Standards followed?
7. Describe the results, noting the changes in the visual character, social character, economic value, historical value, educational value. Was the project a success? By what criteria are you judging the project? Be specific!
8. Discuss the lessons to be learned from the case. What may be applicable to other situations?

Sometime in the next month, make an appointment to meet with the professor to discuss the paper, and receive approval for the projects selected as well as suggestions for pursuing your research.

A 12-MINUTE PRESENTATION will take place on one of the last two class days. While the order of items in the outline may be changed, the presentation should cover all of the material 1 - 8 above. It should include good images of both the project and the community, as well as good graphics that explain the project economics, stakeholders and other information. Your narrative should be lively, comprehensive, and aimed at a professional audience. **DO NOT READ THE TEXT IN YOUR SLIDES.** Each presentation will be followed by 5 minutes of class discussion, led by an assigned interlocutor.

The final version of the 30-40 PAGE TERM PAPER is due at noon on the date specified in the syllabus. The paper should be 12 point, 1.5 line spacing, printed on both sides. Images are important, as is a bibliography that cites and describes your sources, both texts and individuals.

Plagiarism results in a failing grade. Clarity and organization are important. Grammar and spelling count. For foot/endnotes and bibliography use the Chicago Manual of Style (generally considered the standard for historians).